

# 4

## Finding and Reading the Best Sources

---

The research paper tests your ability to find and cite appropriate and relevant sources. So your task is twofold: (1) you must read and personally evaluate the sources for your own benefit as a writer, and (2) you must present them to your reader in your text as validated and authentic sources.

This chapter offers tips about selecting and using the sources. It cuts to the heart of the matter: How do I find the best sources? Should I read all or just part of a source? How do I respond to it? The chapter also demonstrates how to write both an annotated bibliography and a review of the literature on a limited topic.

Some student researchers photocopy entire journal articles and carry armloads of books from the library. Such diligence is misplaced. The quality of your citations far outweighs the quantity of your source materials.

### 4a Finding the Best Source Materials

Be skeptical about accepting every printed word as being the truth. Constantly review and verify to your own satisfaction the words of your sources. Use some of the following techniques for finding the most reliable sources.

#### Consulting with Your Instructor and the Librarians

Do not hesitate in asking your instructor or the librarians for help in finding sources. Instructors know the field, know the best writers, and can provide a brief list to get you started. Sometimes instructors will pull books from their office shelves to give you a starting point.

Librarians know the resources of the library. Their job is to serve your needs. If you ask for help, they will often walk into the stacks with you to find the appropriate reference books or relevant journal articles.

### Using Recent Sources

A book may look valuable, but if its copyright date is 1938 the content has probably been replaced by recent research and current developments. Scientific and technical topics always require up-to-date research. Learn to consult monthly and quarterly journals as well as books.

### Evaluating Internet Sources

The Internet supplies mammoth amounts of material, some of it excellent and some not so good. You must make judgments about the validity of these materials. In addition to your common sense judgment, here are a few guidelines:

1. Use the "edu" and "org" sites. These will be home pages developed by an educational institution, such as Ohio State University, or by a professional organization, such as the American Psychological Association. The "gov" (government) and "mil" (military) sites usually have reliable materials. The "com" (commercial) sites become suspect.
2. Look for the *professional* affiliation of the writer, which you will find in the opening credits or in an E-mail address.
3. A bibliography that accompanies the article will usually indicate the scholarly nature of this writer's work.
4. Be wary of usenet discussion groups. Some of these people are just airing complaints without sound and fundamental evidence to support their opinions.
5. Treat E-mail messages as "mail," not scholarly articles.
6. Access the hypertext links to other professional sites. However, in your search of new sites remember that many commercial sites want to sell you something.

### Using Journals Rather than Magazines

Beware of biased reporting. In general, scholarly journals offer more reliable evidence than popular magazines. The authors of journals write for academic honor, and they document all sources. In addition, journal writers publish through university presses and academic organizations that require every article to pass the scrutiny of a jury of critics before its publication. A journal article about child abuse found in *Child Development* or in *Journal of Marriage and the Family* should be reliable. A magazine article about child abuse in a Sunday newspaper supplement or in a popular magazine may be less reliable in its facts and opinions.

Usually, but not in every case, you can identify a journal in these ways:

1. The journal does not have a colorful cover; in fact, the table of contents is often displayed on the cover.

2. There are no colorful graphics and photography to introduce each article, just a title and name of the author.
3. The word *journal* often appears in the title (e.g., *The Journal of Sociology*).
4. The yearly issues of a journal are bound into a book.
5. Usually, the pages of a journal are numbered continuously through all issues for a year (unlike magazines which are always paged anew with each issue).
6. You can find a journal article with just the volume number and the page numbers. You can best find a magazine article with day/month/year and the page numbers.

### **Using Scholarly Books Rather than Trade Books and Encyclopedias**

Like journal articles, scholarly books are subjected to careful review before publication. They are published because they give the very best treatment on a subject. They are not published to make money; in fact, many scholarly books lose money for the publishers. Scholarly books, including textbooks, treat academic topics with in-depth discussions and careful documentation of the evidence. A college library is a repository for scholarly books—technical and scientific works, doctoral dissertations, publications of the university presses, and many textbooks.

Trade books are published to make money for the authors and the publishers. They seldom treat with depth any scholarly subject. *How to Launch a Small Business* or *Landscaping with Rocks* are typical titles of nonfiction trade books to be found in book stores, not in a college library (although public libraries often have vast holdings in trade books).

Encyclopedias, by design, contain brief surveys of every well-known person, event, place, and accomplishment. They will serve you well during preliminary investigation, but most instructors prefer that you go beyond encyclopedias in order to cite from scholarly books and journal articles.

### **Using Biographies to Evaluate an Author**

You may need to search out information about an author for several reasons:

1. To verify the standing and reputation of somebody that you want to paraphrase or quote in your paper.
2. To provide biographical details in your introduction. For example, the primary topic may be Carl Jung's psychological theories of the unconscious, but some information about Jung's career might be appropriate in the paper.
3. To discuss a creative writer's life in relation to his or her work. That is, Joyce Carol Oates's personal life may shed some light on your reading of her stories or novels.

You can learn about a writer and his or her work on the Internet or in a printed biography. At a search engine, such as *Alta Vista*, just type in the name of an author and see what develops. The best writers will usually have several sites devoted to them with articles by and about them.

The librarian can help you find appropriate printed biographies, such as these:

- Contemporary Authors*, a set of biographies on contemporary writers
- Dictionary of American Negro Biography*, a review of writers and important figures in African-American history
- Who's Who in Philosophy*, a list and discussion of the best writers and thinkers in the field

You can find reference works similar to these three books for almost every field. Appendix A, pages 333–66, lists many of them.

### **Conducting a Citation Search**

Citation searching discovers authors who have been cited repeatedly in the literature. For example, one writer located the same name, *Kagan, J.*, in the bibliographies of three articles (see Figure 25). That information signals Kagan's importance to research in this area. The student researcher would be wise to read Kagan's material.

You should search several bibliographies and mark your bibliography cards with stars or circles each time a source is cited. Two or more stars will suggest *must* reading. The sources themselves have suggested a few important books and articles. Three citation indexes will do some of this work for you:

- Arts and Humanities Citation Index (AHCI)* 1977–date.
- Science Citation Index (SCI)* 1961–date.
- Social Sciences Citation Index (SSCI)* 1966–date.

### **Examining the Book Reviews**

Whenever one book serves as the cornerstone for your research, you can test its critical reputation by reading a review or two. Two works provide summaries and critical points of view:

- Book Review Digest*. New York: H. W. Wilson, 1905–date.  
Arranged alphabetically by author, this work provides an evaluation of several thousand books each year. It features summaries and brief quotations from the reviews to uncover the critical reception of the work.
- The Booklist*. Chicago: American Library Assn., 1905–date.  
A monthly magazine that reviews new books for librarians. This work includes brief summaries and recommendations.

Graham, S., & Folkes, V. S. (1990). *Attribution theory: Applications to achievement, mental health, and interpersonal conflict*. Hillsdale, NJ: Erlbaum.

Kagan, J., Kearsley, R. B., & Zelazo, P. R. (1978). *Infancy: Its place in human development*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Levy, D. M. (1957). Studies in sibling rivalry. Research Monographs, *American Orthopsychiatric Association*

Kagan, J. (1984). *The nature of the child*. New York: Basic.

Kagan, J. (1992). Yesterday's premises, tomorrow's promises. *Developmental Psychology*, 28, 990-997.

Kagan, J. (1994). *Galen's prophecy: Temperament in human nature*. New York: Basic.

Kagan, J., Rossman, B. L., Day, D., Albert, J., & Phillips, W. (1964). Information processing in the child: Significance of analytic and reflective attitudes. *Psychological Monographs*, 78(Whole No. 578).

Goldsmith, H. H., & Rothbart, M. K., (1992). *Laboratory Temperament Assessment Battery (LABTAB)*. Pre- and Locomotor Versions. University of Oregon.

Kagan, J. (1984). *The nature of the child*. New York: Basic Books.

Kochanska, G. (1993). Toward a synthesis of parental socialization and child temperament in early development of conscience. *Child Development*, 64, 325-347.

**Figure 25**  
From *Child Development*, 1997, author who appears in three different bibliographies.

Other reviews are hidden here and there in magazines and journals. To find them, use one of the following indexes:

*Book Review Index*. Detroit: Gale, bimonthly.

This work indexes reviews in 225 magazines and journals.

*Index to Book Reviews in the Humanities*. Williamston, Michigan: Phillip Thompson Publ., annually.

This index to reviews in humanities periodicals has entries listed by author, title, and then reviewer.

*Index to Book Reviews in the Social Sciences*. Williamston, Michigan: Phillip Thompson Publ., annually.

This index to reviews in social science periodicals has entries listed by author, title, and then reviewer.

*Current Book Review Citations*. New York: H. W. Wilson, annually.

This work gives an author-title index to book reviews published in more than 1,000 periodicals.

The sample page of *Book Review Digest* shown in Figure 26 shows you the type of information available in a review of books. After bibliographic details,

it summarizes the book and then provides the reviews, one from *Booklist* and another from *The Library Journal*. Both reviewers give a positive response to the book, so a researcher could feel good about using it as a source.

1	<p><b>MONROE, PAULA ANN.</b> Left-brain finance for right-brain people; a money guide for the creatively inclined. 268p il pa \$18.95 1996 Sourcebooks</p>
2	<p>332.024 1. Personal finance 2. Investments 3. Insurance 4. Estate planning. ISBN 1-57071-056-2 (pa) LC95-48251</p>
4	<p>SUMMARY: Focusing on personal financial planning, the author discusses "defining one's financial goals, learning how money gets spent and made, and protecting one's assets." (Booklist). Index.</p>
5	<p>REVIEW: <i>Booklist</i> v92 p1554 My 15 '96. Brad Hooper (190w) "With this extremely helpful book in hand, the sensitive artist who can barely keep a checkbook balanced can come up with a personal financial picture and plan. With neither condescension nor jargon, Monroe, a right-brainer herself, addresses those with little or no experience in or inclination for financial issues, guiding them in establishing a complete financial program for themselves....A perfect public library purchase for the business collection".</p>
6	<p>REVIEW: <i>Libr J</i> v121 p106 My 1 '96. Joseph Barth (100w) "Aimed at the quantitatively challenged, this excellent financial planning guide makes liberal use of graphics to illustrate the important but—let's face it—dull essentials of finance. Monroe, formerly and English teacher and presently a financial planner, stresses the need to set financial goals. She then treats each significant financial obstacle confronting individuals, providing, for instance, a helpful explanation of the economic advantage of home ownership. . . . This is a useful introductory title for individuals of either brain orientation."</p>

**Figure 26**

From Book Review Digest, 1997 (1) Author and title, (2) Dewey call number and subject entries for card catalog (3) Library of Congress call number (4) First entry is a description of the work (5) Booklist's evaluation of the book (6) Library Journal's evaluation of the book.

## 4b Reading All or Part of a Source

Confronted by several books and articles, many writers have trouble determining the value of material and the contribution it will make to the research paper. To save time, you must be selective in your reading. To serve your

reader, you must cite carefully selected material that is pertinent to the argument. Avoid dumping huge blocks of quotation into the paper because you will lose your voice as the writer.

### Evaluating an Article

1. The *title*. Look for key words that have relevance to your topic before you start reading the article. For example, *Children and Parents* may look ideal for child abuse research until you read the subtitle: *Children and Parents: Growing up in New Guinea*.
2. An *abstract*. If an abstract is available on CD-ROM or on an abstracting service (e.g., *Psychological Abstracts*), read it before going in search of the printed article. If a printed article is preceded by an abstract, read it first. Reading an abstract is the best way to ascertain if an essay or a book will serve your specific needs.
3. The *opening paragraphs*. If the opening of an article shows no relevance to your study, abandon it.
4. Each *topic sentence* of paragraphs of the body. These first sentences of each paragraph will give you a digest of the author's main points. See Figure 27 for an article highlighted in vital places.
5. The *closing paragraphs*. If the opening of an article seems promising, skim the closing for relevance. Read the entire article only if this survey encourages you.
6. *Author credits*. Learn something about the credentials of the author. Magazine articles often provide brief biographical profiles of authors. The backs of book jackets often do the same. Even journal articles will include the author's academic affiliation and some credits. Internet home pages provide the same sort of information.

### Evaluating a Book

A book requires you to check several additional items:

1. The *table of contents*. A book's table of contents may reveal chapters that pertain to your topic. Often, only one chapter is useful. For example, Richard Ellmann's book *Oscar Wilde* has one chapter, "The Age of Dorian," devoted to Wilde's book *The Picture of Dorian Gray*. If your research focuses on this novel, then the chapter, not the entire book, will demand your attention.
2. The *book jacket*, if one is available. For example, the jacket to Richard Ellmann's *Oscar Wilde* says:

Ellmann's *Oscar Wilde* has been almost twenty years in work, and it will stand, like his universally admired *James Joyce*, as the

## Second thoughts about integration

*Black ambivalence about busing has less to do with ideology than with results*

By Jerelyn Eddings

Since court-ordered school busing began in 1971, it has been the subject of rancorous debate. Many white opponents have decried busing as too disruptive to neighborhoods, while black communities and civil rights activists hailed it as the only solution to separate and unequal school systems. Now there's a new twist: A number of black leaders are pushing to jettison busing and get out of the desegregation business. Frustrated with the slow pace of progress in their schools, prominent blacks in places as varied as Prince George's County, Md., Yonkers, N.Y., and Seattle are challenging the old line on busing: Better to spend scant resources on improving their schools, they argue, than on chasing the rainbow of integration.

Even the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People, whose name is synonymous with the fight for desegregation, appears torn on the issue. Chairman Myrlie Evers-

Williams had promised a major debate on the subject at the organization's annual convention in Pittsburgh last week, but then backed off. She used her keynote address instead to make a firm statement in support of integration—and against the “rats” trying to divide the organization.

The tensions that had been simmering below the surface since the NAACP fired two local presidents for arguing against busing were in full view at the convention. In a letter distributed to convention delegates, Robert H. Robinson, one of the ousted presidents, argued: “The NAACP establishment is using the same arguments for desegregation that it made in the 1950s.”

**Demographic changes.** Although it is taking place within the context of a larger debate about integration vs. separatism, the new busing controversy is less about political philosophy than about practical concerns like the quality of schools and the best use of scant educational resources.

Twenty-five years ago, Prince George's County was a mostly white, largely rural jurisdiction with a racial past so bitter that blacks referred to it as “little Georgia.” In 1972, the NAACP won a school desegregation case against the county, and the school system has been operating un-

**Figure 27**

*Article with highlighting on the opening, the topic sentences, and the closing.*  
(Source: *U.S. News & World Report*, July 28, 1997)

definitive life. The book's emotional resonance, its riches of authentic color and conversation, and the subtlety of its critical illuminations give dazzling life to this portrait of the complex man, the charmer, the great playwright, the daring champion of the primacy of art.

Such information can stimulate your reading and note taking from this important book.



der court orders to bus students ever since.

But busing in Prince George's may no longer make sense, as the area has undergone a dramatic demographic shift. The county now boasts one of the largest middle-class, African-American populations in the country, and the school system is 73 percent black. As a result, busing programs that once carried black students to white neighborhoods now often simply move them from one black neighborhood to another. "Busing was useful in the early years, but now the black population is too large," says school board Chairman Kenneth Johnson.

While demographic changes have undermined busing's popularity in Prince George's and other "white flight" communities, the main reason for the growing ambivalence toward busing is that it often hasn't raised educational achievement. In Yonkers, N.Y., for example, blacks still score nearly two grade levels below whites on standardized tests a decade after a federal court ordered busing; as a result, an effort is underway in Yonkers to do away with busing. Similarly, in Seattle, the new school superintendent—John Standord, an African-American retired Army general—has maintained that busing is doing nothing to improve test scores.

**Better education.** In places such as these, the focus is shifting away from trying to avoid "separate" schools and toward efforts to achieve "equal" ones instead. "The issue with the NAACP is that some of the membership is saying we can't just keep emphasizing integration. We have to put some emphasis on improving schools and the economic life of the black community, and I think frankly that most of the people within the NAACP realize that," says Alvin Pous-saint, a Harvard University professor and expert on racial attitudes.

Prince George's is trying to win court approval to replace busing with a new plan that concentrates on building and improving neighborhood schools. "We need to look at what busing was intended to do," says the school board's Johnson. "It was never about black kids sitting next to white kids; it was about an inequitable distribution of resources."

"We need to redefine what desegregation is," says Alvin Thornton, who devised the neighborhood-schools plan. "It's about making the black child whole—even if that means educating them in schools that happen to be all black."

With Jeannye Thornton  
and Barbra Murray

3. The *foreword*, *preface*, or *introduction*. Often an author's *preface* or *introduction* serves as a critical overview of the entire book, pinpointing the primary subject of the text and the particular approach of this author. Read an author's preface to find a statement of purpose or an author's perspective on the subject. For example, Ellmann opens his books *Oscar Wilde* by saying:

Oscar Wilde: we have only to hear the great name to anticipate that what will be quoted as his will surprise and delight us. Among

the writers identified with the 1890s, Wilde is the only one whom everyone still reads. The various labels that have been applied to the age—Aestheticism, Decadence, the Beardsley period—ought not to conceal that fact that our first association with it is Wilde, refulgent, majestic, ready to fall.

Such an introduction describes the nature of the book: Ellmann will portray Wilde as the dominating literary figure of the 1890s. A *foreword* is often written by somebody other than the author. It is often insightful and worthy of quotation.

4. The *index*. A book's *index* will list names and terminology with page numbers for all items mentioned within the text. For example, the index to *Oscar Wilde* lists about eighty items for *The Picture of Dorian Gray*, among them:

writing of, 310–14; possible sources for, 311; W's Preface to, 311, 315, 322, 335; homosexuality and, 312, 318; magazine publication of, 312, 319, 320; W's self-image in, 312, 319; literature and painting in, 312–131; underlying legend of, 314–15

The index, by virtue of its detailed listing, has determined the relevance of the book to your research.

## 4c Responding to the Sources

After you find source material relevant to your subject, you must respond in several ways:

1. Read the material.
2. As you read, write notes that record key ideas.
3. Write notations on the margins of photocopied materials.
4. Outline the key ideas of an article.
5. Write a *précis* (see definition on page 94) to summarize the whole.
6. Identify the source information and relevant page numbers.

### Selecting Key Ideas for Your Notes

In many instances you may borrow only one idea from a source that you can rephrase into your own words. One student borrowed from a portion of a bulletin on air bag safety.

### **New Rules Proposed by NHTSA to Reduce Dangers of Air Bags**

The National Highway Traffic Safety Administration (NHTSA) is considering new rules to minimize the dangers of air bags to children and small adults, while preserving the lifesaving benefit of the devices.

Calling for a phase-in of smart air bag technology, the proposal also contains more immediate measures such as enhanced warning labels and a reduction in the deployment force of bags.

#### **Smart Technology**

"Smart" air bag technology will allow the deployment force of the bag to be determined by factors such as the weight or position of the occupant. Development of the technology has been underway for some time, and Mercedes has already introduced a Seiman system which can detect the presence of a child safety seat in the front passenger position and disable the air bag.

Use this  
idea!

#### **Depowering**

NHTSA will propose a reduction of between 20-35 percent of the deployment force of air bags until smart technology is in place. The agency believes this action will reduce the incidence of injury and improve the performance of air bags for belted occupants including children, individuals with acute medical conditions and small-stature adults, while still providing significant protection for unbelted occupants.

#### **Options for Owners**

NHTSA will also propose allowing dealers to deactivate the air bags of any vehicle owner who requests it, such as families who need to have children in the front seat for medical monitoring purposes, car pools with front-seated children, short-stature individuals and others who have reasonable concerns about a potential danger....

Rather than copy the entire piece or copy the one paragraph, the researcher read first, related the reading to her thesis and her own outline, and wrote this summary:

#### **From "New Rules," page 1**

Technology is now being developed for the automatic disabling of an air bag when it detects a child or small adult in the seat.

The writer has selected only a small portion of the text for her notes, that which relates to technological advances.

### **Outlining the Key Ideas of a Source**

Most books have a table of contents which outlines the basic ingredients of the book. Consult it for issues that deserve your critical reading. In the case

of an essay, you can frame your own outline to capture an author's primary themes; that is, list the main ideas and subtopics to show the hierarchy of issues, to identify parallel parts, and to locate supporting ideas. The goal is to discover the author's primary and secondary ideas. The outline of the "New Rules" article might look like this:

#### **New Rules for Air Bags**

##### **Smart technology**

- Detects position

- Detects weight

- Detects child safety seat

##### **Depowering the bags**

- Reduce deployment power

- Make a 20–35 percent reduction

##### **Give options to owners**

##### **Allow them to deactivate**

- For children

- For medical monitoring

- For short-statured individuals

Such an outline gives the researcher a clear overview of the issues.

### **Making Notations on Photocopied Materials**

Avoid making marks on library books and magazines, but *do* make marginal notes in your own books and magazines or on photocopied materials. Underline sentences, circle key ideas, ask questions, and react with your own comments.

### **Writing a Summary or a Précis**

A *summary* condenses into a brief note the general nature of a source. In some cases you might use the summary in your paper, but more than anything else it serves to remind you later on about the source's relevance to your study. Note this example of a *summary* and compare it with the *précis* below:

#### **From "New Rules," page 1**

NHTSA wants smart technology to detect little people in the seats, to put less power in the air bag, and to give more options for auto owners to deactivate air bags.

For further details about writing a summary, see Section 5e, page 114.

A *précis* is a highly polished summary, one that you can transfer to your paper or use in an annotated bibliography. It often uses direct quotation from the original source. Use the *précis* to review a piece of writing or to write a plot summary.

**From “New Rules,” page 1**

NHTSA asks for “smart” air bags that will “allow the deployment force of the bag to be determined by factors such as the weight or position of the occupant” (1). It suggests reducing the deployment force of air bags by 20–35 percent. It also recommends that dealers be permitted to “deactivate the air bags of any vehicle owner who requests it” (1).

For further details and examples, see Section 5f, pages 115–17.

## **4d Selecting a Mix of Both Primary and Secondary Sources**

*Primary sources* are the original words of a writer. The primary sources include novels, speeches, eyewitness accounts, letters, autobiographies, interviews, or the results of original research. Feel free to quote often from a primary source because it has direct relevance to your discussion. If you examine a poem by Dylan Thomas, you must quote the poem. If you examine Bill Clinton’s domestic policies on health care, you must quote from White House documents.

The best evidence you can offer, when writing about a poem, story, novel, or drama, will be the words of the author. Therefore, quote often from these works in order to defend the thesis of a literary paper. The same is true with a history paper, in which you should cite the words of the key figure, whether it be Thomas Jefferson, Marie Antoinette, or Karl Marx.

In the social sciences your best evidence will be found in the wording of original case studies and reports of social workers and psychiatrists. In a similar fashion, education will offer test data, interviews, pilot studies, and other forms of primary information. Thus, every discipline will offer you plenty of primary source material, as shown on page 96.

*Secondary sources* are writings about the primary sources, about an author, or about somebody’s accomplishments. Examples of secondary sources are a report on a presidential speech, a review of new scientific findings, or an analysis of a poem. A biography provides a second-hand view of the life of a notable person. A history book interprets events. These evaluations, analyses, or interpretations provide ways of looking at original, primary sources.

Do not quote too liberally from secondary sources. Be selective. Use a well-worded sentence, not the entire paragraph. Incorporate a key phrase into your text, not eight or nine lines. (See “Selecting Key Ideas,” 92–93.)

The subject area of a research paper determines in part the nature of the source materials. Use the chart on page 96 as a guide:

### Citing from Primary and Secondary Sources

	<i>Primary Sources</i>	<i>Secondary Sources</i>
Literature	Novels, poems, plays, short stories, letters, diaries, manuscripts, auto biographies, films, videos of live performances	Journal articles, reviews, biographies, critical books about writers and their works
Government Political Science History	Speeches, writings by presidents and others, the <i>Congressional Record</i> , and reports of agencies and departments, documents written by historic figures	Newspaper reports, news magazines, political journals and newsletters, journal articles, history books
Social Sciences	Case studies, findings from surveys and questionnaires; reports of social workers, psychiatrists, and lab technicians	Commentary and evaluations in reports, documents, journal articles, and books
Sciences	Tools and methods, experiments, findings from tests and experiments, observations, discoveries, and test patterns	Interpretations and discussions of test data as found in journals and books (scientific books, which are quickly dated, are less valuable than up-to-date journals)
Fine Arts	Films, paintings, music, sculptures as well as reproductions and synopses of these for research purposes	Evaluations in journal articles, critical reviews, biographies, and critical books about the authors and their works
Business	Market research and testing, technical studies and investigations, drawings, designs, models, memorandums and letters, computer data	Discussion of the business world in newspapers, business magazines, journals, government documents, and books
Education	Pilot studies, term projects, sampling results, tests and test data, surveys, interviews, observations, statistics, and computer data	Analysis and evaluation of educational experimentation in journals, pamphlets, books, and reports

## 4e Preparing an Annotated Bibliography

An *annotation* is a summary of the contents of a book or article. A *bibliography* is a list of sources on a selected topic. Thus, an annotated bibliography does two important things: (1) it gives a bibliographic entry to all your sources, and (2) it summarizes the contents of each book or article. The annotated bibliography will evaluate the strength of your sources.

- For instructions on writing an annotation, see 5f, "Using the Précis to Write an Annotated Bibliography," page 116.
- For instructions on writing the citation to a source in MLA style see Chapter 9 (for other styles, consult Chapters 10–11).

*Note:* This writer chose the Arial font for developing the paper and used italic lettering rather than underscoring. You may also prepare your paper in this fashion; that is, you are not required to use the Courier font for all of your papers.

### Annotated Bibliography

- Clark, Charles S. "Pursuing the Paranormal." *The CQ Researcher* 6.12 (29 Mar. 1996): 265–288. Clark explores the new interest in paranormal activity and unexplained phenomena ranging from UFO sightings to alien abduction testimonials to psychic abilities. This new interest in the paranormal is attributed by Clark to the high level of mistrust in government, which is due in part to the decade-old rumors about the coverup of the Roswell Incident. A brief chronology of paranormal activity from the 1940 to 1996 is given, as well as annotated bibliographical information on sources pertaining to paranormal activity.
- Headquarters United States Air Force. *The Roswell Report: Fact Versus Fiction in the New Mexico Desert*. D301.82/7:R73. Washington: GPO, 1995. In an attempt to end rumors of government conspiracy, this is the first official report on the "Roswell Incident" issued by the Department of the Air Force regarding the alleged UFO crash in Roswell, New Mexico. The report contains Colonel Richard L. Weaver's report of Air Force research and a synopsis of balloon research findings. A number of interviews with and statements of airmen stationed at Roswell in 1947 are also disclosed.
- Hesemann, Michael and Philip Mantle. *Beyond Roswell: The Alien Autopsy Film, Area 51, & the U.S. Government Coverup of UFOs*. New York: Marlowe, 1997. This book by a cultural anthropologist, Hesemann, and the Director of Investigations for the British UFO Research Association, Mantle, delves into the specifics of the Roswell UFO crash and the alien autopsy that followed. A number of eyewitness accounts and affidavits are included to provide support for the argument that such an event actually occurred and

to prove the contradictions present in the official Air Force report on the subject.

- "Interview with Carl Sagan, Author, Astronomer." *NOVA Online*. 1996. 31 July 1997 (<http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/nova/aliens/carlsagan.html>). In this interview, the fact that Sagan believes in extraterrestrial life is evident; however, he is skeptical of "alien abductions." Sagan fails to see psychological evidence as being proof that such events have occurred and rather sees the lack of physical evidence as proof that they did not occur. He says of two believers in alien abductions, John Mack and Budd Hopkins, that they "want the validation of science" without the "standards of evidence."
- "Interview with John Mack, Psychiatrist, Harvard University." *NOVA Online*. 1996. 31 July 1997 (<http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/nova/aliens/johnmack.html>). Not only does Mack believe in extraterrestrial life, but he also believes that aliens have visited earth and abducted human beings. The basis of his belief lies in the numerous interviews with abductees in which common experiences are described and common injuries are evident. In the interview, Mack gives the details of the commonalities of abductees that provide the foundation for his belief in such occurrences.
- Naeye, Robert. "OK, where are they?" *Astronomy* 24.7 (July 1996): 36+. *InfoTrac: Expanded Academic Index*. CD-ROM. Information Access. July 1997. Naeye writes that there is little scientific evidence to support the hypothesis that intelligent forms of life exist on other planets in the universe. Having only life on earth to study, scientists consider the fundamental characteristics of life on this planet to be universal. When these fundamental characteristics are combined with the theories of the evolution of life, there is little scientific basis for the belief that intelligent life actually exists elsewhere in the universe.
- "Poll: Most in U.S. Believe in Space Life." *Yahoo! News*. 28 July 1997. 31 July 1997 ([http://www.yahoo.com/headlines/970828/news/stories/space\\_1.html](http://www.yahoo.com/headlines/970828/news/stories/space_1.html)). This news story gives the statistical findings of a Harris poll released Monday, July 28, 1997. The poll of 1,002 adults was taken between July 9 and 14; it revealed that the belief in intelligent life in space has increased from fifty-three to fifty-nine percent since last year. Other specific statistical information is also included where space exploration is concerned.
- "Poll: U.S. Hiding Knowledge of Aliens." *CNN Interactive*. 15 June 1997. 31 July 1997 (<http://www.cnn.com/US/9706/15/ufo.poll/index.html>). The statistic that eighty percent of Americans think that the government is hiding knowledge of extraterrestrial life forms is included in this report of a CNN/Time poll released July 15th. Other



statistical data includes the belief of sixty-four percent that aliens have contacted humans and the belief of fifty percent that aliens have abducted humans. Statistical data on the Roswell incident and personal knowledge of alien encounters is also included.

Rayl, A.J.S. "Inside the Military UFO Underground." *Omni* 16.7 (Apr. 1994): 48+. *InfoTrac: Expanded Academic Index*. CD-ROM. Information Access. July 1997. In 1969, the U.S. Government abandoned unidentified flying object research; however, three insiders give testimony in this article to the contrary. Robert O. Dean, retired Command Sergeant Major; Bob Lazar, independent contract scientist and businessman; and Charles I. Halt, retired United States Air Force Colonel, report that underground investigations are still being conducted by the U.S. Government. In this article, the claims, backgrounds, and stories of these three men are reported, as well as critical and official responses to their claims.

"Roswell Report: Case Closed." *Air Force Web Information Service*. 24 June 1997. 31 July 1997 (<http://www.af.mil/lib/roswell/>). In this executive summary, the release of a second report on the "Roswell Incident" is discussed. This report, "The Roswell Report: Case Closed," discloses the Air Force activities and experiments conducted on the base at Roswell, New Mexico, in an attempt to disprove claims of a governmental cover-up of UFO activity and "alien bodies." The web page summarizes the conclusions drawn from documented research.

Stacy, Dennis. "Cosmic Conspiracy: Six Decades of Government UFO Cover-Ups." *Omni* 16.7 (Apr. 1994): 34+. *SIRS Researcher on the Web*. 31 July 1997 (<http://researcher.sirs.com/cgi-bin/res-article-display?4PR030A>). In this article, Stacy follows the reported incident of a UFO crash in Roswell, New Mexico, and the recovery of the debris by the Army Air Corps. In addition, he examines the information on Project Blue Book released by the U.S. Government. Interviews with many believers in the conspiracy to coverup knowledge of alien encounters are also included in the article.

## 4f Preparing a Review of the Literature on a Topic

The review of literature presents a set of summaries in essay form for two purposes.

1. It helps you investigate the topic because it forces you to examine and then to show how each source addresses the problem. *Note:* Do not simply list summaries of the sources without relating each source to your thesis.

2. It organizes and classifies the sources in some reasonable manner for the benefit of the reader.

The essay below introduces the issue of alien life forms, discusses the debate, sets science against psychiatry, and offers a summary.

To write summaries of your key sources, see Section 5e, page 114.

To blend source material into your survey, see Section 7a, pages 156–57.

To write the bibliography entries, see Chapter 9, pages 233–72.

Bonds 1

Leigh Bonds

English 101

24 October 1997

#### Selected Review of Literature:

##### Is the Earth Being Visited by Intelligent Alien Life Forms?

According to a CNN poll taken on June 15, 1997, eighty percent of Americans feel that the government is hiding knowledge of the existence of extraterrestrial life forms and sixty-four percent believe that aliens have contacted humans. According to Gallup polls, over twenty-three million people in the United States believe they have seen UFOs and about two percent of the population believe themselves to be abductees. With the numbers of believers in the existence of intelligent extraterrestrial life increasing from fifty-three to fifty-nine percent from 1996 to 1997, the question must ultimately surface: Is the earth being visited by intelligent life forms?

The purpose of this survey is to examine two of the numerous debates over alien encounters. The first involves the reports on the "Roswell incident" and UFO research issued by the U.S. Government, which has spawned a debate between those who stand by these reports and those who feel that these reports are merely coverups withholding of the actual truth. The second places the theories of science against the findings of psychiatry in a debate over the substantiality of alien encounter allegations.

#### The Debate Over Roswell

In 1995, the Headquarters of the United States Air Force released *The Roswell Report: Fact Versus Fiction in the New Mexico Desert*. This report, compiled by Colonel Richard L. Weaver and First Lieutenant James McAndrew, addressed the request made by Representative Steven H. Schiff for information on the alleged UFO crash in Roswell in 1947. The report concluded that there was no evidence that a UFO had

## Bonds 2

crashed at Roswell, and rather, it was a classified, experimental weather balloon, Project MOGUL, designed for atmospheric monitoring.

According to the "Roswell Report: Case Closed" web site, the Headquarters of the United States Air Force released a second report on the Roswell incident on June 24, 1997, that shares the name of the web site. The report supports the claims of the first report that the Air Force was engaged in high-altitude balloon experimentation. However, this report adds that the "aliens" observed at Roswell were, in fact, anthropomorphic test dummies, and that the military units previously thought to arrive at the base to retrieve the UFO wreckage were in fact engaged in the anthropomorphic dummy recovery operations.

In the April 1994 issue of *OMNI*, an article appeared entitled "Inside the Military UFO Underground." Having claimed to abandon UFO research in 1969, the United States government continued to conduct underground investigations on the matter according to three informants interviewed in this article. With one informant being a propulsion system engineer and the other two being highly ranked military personnel, credibility is lent to their stories. An official response, which is essentially no response, follows each story along with a critical statement by personnel from the Center for UFO Studies.

In the same issue of *OMNI*, another article entitled "Cosmic Conspiracy: Six Decades of Government UFO Cover-Ups" analyzes the story issued by the Air Force involving the Roswell incident. The article builds upon the statement made by Colonel William Blanchard to the *Roswell Daily Record* for July 8, 1947 that the intelligence office of the 509th Bomb Group "was fortunate enough to gain possession of a disc through the cooperation of local ranchers and the Sheriff's office of Chaves County." Opinions of both skeptics and supporters of the government's report on Project Blue Book are included in the article.

In the March 29, 1996, *CQ Researcher*, skepticism is voiced by Richard Hall, chairman of the Washington, D.C.-area Fund for UFO Research, where the Air Force's report on Roswell is concerned. He refers to the article as a "terrible example of overkill" designed by its size to discourage the public from analyzing its argument. He says that the balloons were actually launched long after 1947, and that the eyewitness accounts can hardly be discounted.

The book *Beyond Roswell* examines all of the information known about the Roswell incident from that released by the U.S. Government to a number of written affidavits and eyewitness accounts of what occurred after the bright lights were spotted in the sky on July 4. Believing that the alien autopsy film, the Santilli film, that aired on the FOX network two years ago was real, Hesemann and Mantle interview numerous individuals who corroborate the story that alien bodies were

extracted from the UFO wreckage sight and that autopsies were performed on these lifeless forms.

### **Science v. Psychiatry**

On the side of science is the prominent astronomer Carl Sagan. In an interview for the PBS television show, *NOVA*, Sagan's belief in extraterrestrial life is evident; however, he is skeptical of the increasing numbers of allegations of "alien abductions." Sagan sees the lack of physical evidence that such events occur as being the proof to refute them and fails to see psychological evidence as being proof that such events have occurred. He says of two believers in alien abductions, John Mack and Budd Hopkins, they "want the validation of science" without the "standards of evidence."

In an article entitled "OK, where are they?," Robert Naeye searches for scientific evidence to support the hypothesis that extraterrestrial life exists. Naeye comes to the conclusion that there is actually very little scientific evidence to support the hypothesis that intelligent forms of life exist on other planets in the universe. Scientists consider the fundamental characteristics of life on this planet to be universal; therefore, the absence of many of these fundamentals on other planets makes life, as science knows it, to be improbable. When these fundamental characteristics are combined with the theories of the evolution of life, there is little scientific basis for the belief that intelligent life actually exists elsewhere in the universe.

On the other side of the debate is Harvard psychiatrist, John Mack. In an interview on the PBS program *NOVA*, Mack talks about his findings from interviews with over a hundred alien encounter "experiencers." Not only does Mack believe in extraterrestrial life, but he also believes that aliens have visited earth and abducted human beings. The basis of his belief lies in the common experiences described by "experiencers" and the common injuries that are evident on their bodies following the abductions. The details of the commonalities among the testimonies of abductees are given by Mack to *NOVA* in this interview.

### **Conclusion**

Though the literature selected for this review hardly represents the vast amount of literature on the "Roswell Incident" and the alleged "government cover-up," nor the numerous press releases issued by the Air Force on the subject, it does reflect the issues of the debate. Where the debate between science and psychiatry is concerned, there are also numerous articles written to support the findings of each. The common ground between the two debates is that there is no concrete evidence to support any of the positions, although each position feels that it has such evidence.

## Bonds 4

Until a concrete piece of physical evidence is found that can shed more light on the subject, the government will continue to stand by the two released reports and the skeptics will continue to believe that something is being withheld from them; scientists will continue to demand physical evidence and psychiatrists will firmly stand by their findings in the testimonies of "experiencers." It has been said that Americans have been distrustful of their government since the country was established; however, where information of alien encounters are concerned, many Americans feel that they have every reason to be.

**Works Cited**

- Clark, Charles S. "Pursuing the Paranormal." *The CQ Researcher* 6.12 (29 Mar. 1996): 265–288.
- Edergreen, Katarina. "Alien Abductions—Dream or Reality?" *Alien Abductions*. 31 July 1997 (<http://www.jmk.su.se/mark/global/edergreen/alien.html>).
- Headquarters United States Air Force. *The Roswell Report: Fact Versus Fiction in the New Mexico Desert*. D301.82/7:R73. Washington: GPO, 1995.
- Hesemann, Michael and Philip Mantle. *Beyond Roswell: The Alien Autopsy Film, Area 51, & the U.S. Government Coverup of UFOs*. New York: Marlowe, 1997.
- "Interview with Carl Sagan, Author, Astronomer." *NOVA Online*. 1996. 31 July 1997 (<http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/nova/aliens/carlsagan.html>).
- "Interview with John Mack, Psychiatrist, Harvard University." *NOVA Online*. 1996. 31 July 1997 (<http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/nova/aliens/johnmack.html>).
- Naeye, Robert. "OK, where are they"? *Astronomy* 24.7 (July 1996): 36+. *InfoTrac: Expanded Academic Index*. CD-ROM. Information Access. July 1997.
- "Poll: Most in U.S. Believe in Space Life." *Yahoo! News*. 28 Jul. 1997. 31 July 1997 ([http://www.yahoo.com/headlines/970828/news/stories/space\\_1.htm](http://www.yahoo.com/headlines/970828/news/stories/space_1.htm)).
- "Poll: U.S. Hiding Knowledge of Aliens." *CNN Interactive*. 15 Jun. 1997. 31 July 1997 (<http://www.cnn.com/US/9706/15/ufo.poll/index.html>).
- Rayl, A.J.S. "Inside the Military UFO Underground." *Omni* 16.7 (April 1994): 48+. *InfoTrac: Expanded Academic Index*. CD-ROM. Information Access. July 1997.
- "Roswell Report: Case Closed." *Air Force Web Information Service*. 24 June 1997. 31 July 1997 (<http://www.af.mil/lib/roswell/>).
- Stacy, Dennis. "Cosmic Conspiracy: Six Decades of Government UFO Cover-Ups." *Omni* 16.7 (April 1994): 34+. *SIRS Researcher on the Web*. 31 July 1997 (<http://researcher.sirs.com/cgi-bin/res-article-display?4PR030A>).